

# THE EFFECTIVENESS OF *PHOTOVOICE* IN INCREASING SELF-ESTEEM AND THE CAREER MATURITY OF VOCATIONAL SCHOOL STUDENTS

#### Abdul Hadi\*

Universitas Mercu Buana Yogyakarta, Indonesia E-mail: <u>hadi@mercubuana-yogya.ac.id</u>

## Anifa Tuzzuhroh Nurbaiti

Universitas Mercu Buana Yogyakarta, Indonesia E-mail: anifa.t@mercubuana-yogya.ac.id

# Eka Aryani

Universitas Mercu Buana Yogyakarta, Indonesia E-mail: eka@mercubuana-yogya.ac.id



©2024 by the authors. Submitted for open access publication under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC-BY-SA) license (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/)

\*\*DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.30983/educative.v9i1.8539

\*\*Corresponding Authors\*\*

Submission: June 02, 2024 Revised: June 16, 2024

Accepted: June 27, 2024

Published: June 30, 2024

#### Abstract

Photovoice is a participatory research method that places humans, especially those who are marginalized, as active subjects in the process of data collection and analysis. Rather than being passive research objects, photovoice participants are given the opportunity to express their perspectives, experiences, and knowledge through the lens of a camera. The photovoice method places humans as subjects who have valuable knowledge, experiences, and perspectives. By giving them the tools to express themselves, photovoice can produce a deeper understanding of social issues and encourage positive change. The purpose of this study was to see the effectiveness of photovoice on increasing self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students in Bantul. The research method used was a quasi-experimental method using a non-equivalent control group design, each experimental group and control group will be given a pretest and post-test. The results obtained in this study are that photovoice is effective in increasing self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students.

Keyword: photovoice, self-esteem, career maturity

# Abstrak

Photovoice adalah sebuah metode penelitian partisipatif yang menempatkan manusia, khususnya mereka yang terpinggirkan, sebagai subjek aktif dalam proses pengumpulan data dan analisis. Alih-alih menjadi objek penelitian yang pasif, peserta photovoice diberikan kesempatan untuk mengungkapkan perspektif, pengalaman, dan pengetahuan mereka melalui lensa kamera. Metode photovoice menempatkan manusia sebagai subjek yang memiliki pengetahuan, pengalaman, dan perspektif yang berharga. Dengan memberikan mereka alat untuk mengungkapkan diri mereka sendiri, photovoice dapat menghasilkan pemahaman yang lebih dalam tentang isu-isu sosial dan mendorong perubahan positif. Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah melihat keefektifan photovoice terhadap peningkatan harga diri dan kematangan karir peserta didik SMK di Bantul. Metode penelitian yang digunakan adalah kuasi eksperimen dengan menggunakan non equivalent control group design, masing kelompok eksperimen dan kelompok kontrol akan diberi pretest dan posttest. Hasil yang diperoleh dalam penelitian ini adalah photovoice efektif terhadap peningkatan harga diri dan kematangan karir peserta didik SMK.

Kata Kunci: photovoice, self-esteem, kematangan karier.

# Introduction

Vocational high school education has an important role in preparing students to enter the workforce. Vocational high schools are included in vocational education created by the government to create a workforce that is ready to enter the

industrial world. To improve the quality and relevance of education, vocational education is formed as an alternative in the workforce after



graduating from school<sup>1</sup>. Vocational High School is a vocational education designed to meet the needs of the local, regional or global job market. Vocational Education (SMK) graduates are expected to more easily enter the job market, get jobs according to their skills, and have high career mobility2.

The challenge often faced by vocational school graduates is tight job competition. The number of vocational schools graduates each year is quite large so that the competition to get a job is quite tight. Another challenge faced by vocational school graduates is competition with college graduates, where companies are starting to open job vacancies that were previously only intended for college graduates, so vocational school graduates have to compete with college graduates. From BPS data in 2020, vocational school graduates are graduates with the highest unemployment rate (13.5%) compared to other graduates. The increase in the number of vocational school graduates also occurred in Bantul. In the 2024 Harian Jogia news, there was an indication of an increase in the number of graduates among vocational school graduates in Bantul as seen from the various vocational school development programs carried out in Bantul3.

Various problems are experienced vocational school graduates. Some vocational school graduates do not fully understand their interests, values, and talents, students in vocational schools do not have competency standards according to the majors they are studying. Another problem is that students at the vocational school level often experience inability or lack of understanding in determining the majors they will choose. Based on interviews with guidance and counselling teachers in Bantul, the problem of career maturity is not only one of the causes of low employment for vocational school graduates, but another thing that arises is self-esteem. Self-esteem is an individual's view of themselves as a whole. Individuals evaluate things related to themselves. Individual assessment of the results achieved by analysing the extent to which their behavior is in accordance with their ideals.

In the context of competition for vocational school graduates, both self-esteem and career maturity play a very important role. Vocational school graduates who have high self-esteem and good career maturity will be better prepared to face the challenges of a dynamic working world. They will find it easier to get jobs that suit their interests and abilities and will be able to survive in the long term. Self-esteem and career maturity are important aspects that need to be developed.

High self-esteem can increase learning motivation and self-confidence. Self-esteem is a person's attitude or feeling in assessing and valuing themselves. This includes the individual's beliefs, attitudes, and perceptions about their values and contributions to everyday life<sup>4</sup>. Self-esteem as a subjective evaluation of oneself, includes an individual's views and assessments of their worth, competence, and identity. It reflects the extent to which a person feels valuable, competent, and worthy in themselves.

Self-esteem can affect many aspects of a person's life, including mental health, social relationships, and achievement in various fields, one of which is career. Positive self-esteem can increase a person's motivation and confidence in achieving their career goals. The higher the level of an individual's self-esteem, the higher the level of work readiness<sup>5</sup>. Individuals who have strong self-esteem tend to believe that they can achieve success in their careers.

Career maturity can help students in planning their future and making the right career decisions. Individuals who have high career maturity tend to

Abdul Hadi, et.al 67 Efektivitas Photovoice...

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Agus Sutarna et al., *Manajemen Pendidikan Vokasi*, 2020.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Jetmir Zyberaj et al., "Developing Sustainable Careers during a Pandemic: The Role of Psychological Capital and Career Adaptability," *Sustainability (Switzerland)* 14, no. 5 (2022), https://doi.org/10.3390/su14053105.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Harian Jogja, "Siap Terjun Ke Dunia Industri, Lulusan SMK Harus Tetap Tingkatkan Ketrampilan," 2024, https://jogjapolitan.harianjogja.com/read/2024/05/16/510

<sup>/1174763/</sup>siap-terjun-ke-dunia-industri-lulusan-smk-harustetap-tingkatkan-ketrampilan.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Pawel Holas et al., "The Relationship between Self-Esteem and Self-Compassion in Socially Anxious," *Current Psychology* 42, no. 12 (2023): 10271–76, https://doi.org/10.1007/s12144-021-02305-2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Erni Fatmawati et al., "Kesiapan Kerja Siswa Ditinjau Dari Harga Diri (Self-Esteem) Dan Efikasi Diri (Self-Efficacy)," *Edukasi: Jurnal Pendidikan* 21, no. 1 (June 10, 2023): 1–14, https://doi.org/10.31571/edukasi.v21i1.5462.



explore their careers. They actively seek information about various fields of work, absorb work experiences, and evaluate whether their career choices are in line with their expectations and desires. In addition, individuals who are mature in their careers realize the importance of skill development<sup>6</sup>.

The lack of activities specifically designed to improve self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students is one of the problems that need attention. The problems of vocational high school students have been anticipated by providing guidance and counselling services in schools, methods or alternatives are needed to improve career maturity of vocational high school students. One alternative solution that can be used is by using *photovoice*.

*Photovoice* is a method used in participatory guidance and counselling services that combines photography, group discussions, and reflection to give voice to individuals and communities. *Photovoice* is a process by which individuals can identify, represent, and improve skills through specific photography<sup>7</sup>.

Photovoice practice is based on knowledge that allows individuals to actively reflect on individual strengths. The uniqueness of photovoice lies in the results of individual shots that can be discussed with the aim of providing individuals with an understanding of certain issues. This aims to provide individuals with an understanding of something, open new perspectives, and help solve problems. Photovoice produces in-depth qualitative data about the experiences and views of individuals or groups on certain issues.

The purpose of using this *photovoice* method, such as being able to record and record the advantages and disadvantages of an individual's

environment, allows for critical dialogue with photo discussions in groups, and influences individual decision making. By using *photovoice*, individuals can learn from images to change or strengthen individual views so that they can interpret images and provide learning for individuals and emphasize real actions that will be taken by individuals. There are five stages carried out in *photovoice*, namely (1) determining the problem and the parties who are the targets; (2) dulling participants; (3) introducing the *photovoice* method and facilitating discussion in groups; (4) taking pictures by participants; and (5) discussing the results of the photos<sup>8</sup>.

Photovoice helps individuals emphasize the importance of active and participatory learning experiences in shaping self-identity and life skills. In line with the constructivism theory proposed by Jean Piaget, knowledge is not simply transferred from teacher to learner, but is actively constructed by individuals through interaction with the environment<sup>9</sup>. Participatory learning experiences enable individuals to build deeper and more meaningful understanding. *Photovoice* participatory research method is in line with the principles of self-development theory, as it provides participants with the opportunity to learn through experience and self-reflection.

This *photovoice* method has been widely used in various fields, including education, to empower students and give them the opportunity to express themselves. Previous research has shown that *photovoice* is effective in career development<sup>10</sup>, individual welfare <sup>11</sup>, self-success, self-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Abdullah Atli, "The Effects of Trait-Factor Theory Based Career Counseling Sessions on the Levels of Career Maturity and Indecision of High School Students," *Universal Journal of Educational Research* 4, no. 8 (2016): 1837–47, https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2016.040813.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Caroline Wang and Mary Ann Burris, "Photovoice: Concept, Methodology, and Use for Participatory Needs Assessment," *Health Education and Behavior* 24, no. 3 (1997): 369–87, https://doi.org/10.1177/109019819702400309.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Wang and Burris.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Anupi Samaiya, "Jean Piaget's Cognitive Development," 2022, https://doi.org/10.25215/1001.155.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Rashné R. Jehangir, Arien B. Telles, and Veronica Deenanath, "Using Photovoice to Bring Career into a New Focus for First-Generation College Students," *Journal of Career Development* 47, no. 1 (February 1, 2020): 59–79, https://doi.org/10.1177/0894845318824746.

Connected': Participatory Action Research Using Photovoice to Explore Well-Being in Autistic Young Adults," *Autism* 24, no. 5 (July 1, 2020): 1246–59, https://doi.org/10.1177/1362361319898961.



sustainability<sup>12</sup>, Overcoming Anxiety <sup>13</sup> speaking skills <sup>14</sup>, mental illness recovery <sup>15</sup>, and increase resilience <sup>16</sup>. However, there has not been much research that specifically examines the effectiveness of *photovoice* in increasing self-esteem and career maturity of vocational school students.

This study aims to test the effectiveness of the *photovoice* method in improving self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students. Specifically, this study will answer the question: Is there a significant difference between the experimental group that participated in the *photovoice* activity and the control group in terms of improving self-esteem and career maturity? This study is expected to contribute to the development of more effective guidance and counselling programs to improve self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students.

The results of this study are expected to provide valuable information for educators, counsellors, and educational policy makers in designing programs that focus on students' self-development. This study can also be a reference for further research that wants to examine the effectiveness of the *photovoice* method in different contexts. By increasing the self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students, it is expected to prepare them to become graduates who are ready to face the challenges of the world of work and contribute to the science of guidance and counselling in the personal and career fields.

# Research Method

The type research used is quasi-experimental. Quasi-experimental is research conducted in schools where one class is given a new intervention while another class is not. The quasi-experimental design uses an equivalent control group research

Data analysis technique used Mann-Whitney U test. Mann-Whitney U test a non-parametric test used to compare the medians of two independent groups. Mann-Whitney U test This test is used when the data does not meet the normality assumptions required for the independent t-test. In this study, this test was used to compare the variables of self-esteem and career maturity between the experimental group and the control group after being given an intervention.

# Finding and Discussion

The following are the results of research and discussion of research related to the Effectiveness of *Photovoice* in Increasing Self-Esteem with Career Maturity of SMK students.

## Finding

Based on the results of the distribution of selfesteem scale instruments to the control group of

design. In the non-equivalent control group research design, there are experimental groups and control groups, each of which will be given a pretest and posttest using a self-esteem scale and a career maturity scale. The population in this study was 300 vocational high school students in Bantul The sample determination purposive sampling totaling 80 students. This is based on the provisions of vocational high school students in Bantul Regency who have high, medium, and low self-esteem and career maturity categories. The results obtained were 80 students who were divided into two groups, namely the experimental group and the control group with 40 students in each group. After being divided into two groups, the experimental group was given an intervention using the photovoice method. While the control group was given an intervention of guidance and counselling services.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Dana Harley et al., "Perceptions of Success and Self-Sustainability Among Women Participating in an Entrepreneurial Skills Development and Empowerment Program Through Photovoice," *Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Diversity in Social Work* 29, no. 5 (September 2, 2020): 377–95, https://doi.org/10.1080/15313204.2017.1344900.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Sandita Sanis Faradilla, Teza Yudha, and Moch. Faizal Rizki, "Penanganan Gelandangan Dan Pengemis: Studi Naratif Dengan Photovoice," *Journal Of Social Science Research* 3, no. 5 (2023): 7824–40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Cao Xuan Hieu, "Employing Photovoice in Improving Students' Speaking Skill at a Primary School,"

International Journal of Social Science and Human Research 6, no. 11 (2023): 6752–58, https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v6-i11-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Nastaran Doroud et al., "A Journey of Living Well: A Participatory Photovoice Study Exploring Recovery and Everyday Activities with People Experiencing Mental Illness," *Journal of Mental Health* 31, no. 2 (2022): 246–54, https://doi.org/10.1080/09638237.2021.1952950.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Julie Karmann et al., "Resilience among Older Adults during the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Photovoice Study," *SSM - Qualitative Research in Health* 3, no. November 2022 (2023), https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmqr.2023.100256.

40 and the experimental group of 40 samples of vocational high school students, the following pretest and post-test results were obtained.

**Table 1.** Results of Frequency of Categorization of Pretest and Post-test Self-Esteem of Control Group and Experimental Group

Category	Control Group		Experimental Group	
	Pretest	Post- test	Pretest	Post- test
Low	7	7	6	9
Medium	26	25	27	24
High	7	8	7	7

Table 1 presents a comparison of the frequency of self-esteem categories between the control group and the experimental group, both before and after the intervention. In general, from the table it can be seen that in the stability of the control group, the number of students in each category in the control group tends to be stable between pretest and post-test. This indicates that without any special intervention, there is no significant change in the distribution of self-esteem categories in this group. While in the experimental group, there was a slight shift from the medium category to the low category in the post-test.

Based on the results of the distribution of career maturity scale instruments to the control group and experimental group of vocational high school students, the following pretest and post-test results were obtained.

**Table 2.** Results of the Frequency of Categorization of Pretest and Post-test Career Maturity of the Control Group and Experimental Group

Category	Control Group		Experimental Group	
	Pretest	Post- test	Pretest	Post- test
Low	9	6	7	8
Medium	22	28	28	24
High	9	6	5	8

Table 2 shows that the number of individuals in the low category tends to decrease after the post test, while the medium category increases. This may indicate natural changes or other factors affecting the control group.

The researcher also conducted an analysis of the pretest and post test results of the experimental group which was seen from the comparison of the frequency of categories on the variables of self-esteem and career maturity. The following table shows the results of the frequency of pretest and post-test categorization of self-esteem and career maturity of the experimental group.

**Table 3.** Results of Frequency of Categorization of Pretest and Post-test Self-Esteem and Career Maturity of Experimental Group

	Self-esteem		Career maturity	
Category	Pretest	Post- test	Pretest	Post- test
Low	6	9	7	8
Medium	27	24	28	24
High	7	7	5	8

Table 3 shows fluctuations in the frequency distribution of categories between pretest and post-test, both for self-esteem and career maturity. In the self-esteem variable, there was a slight decrease in the medium category and an increase in the low category after the post-test. This indicates a shift in the distribution, but not significant. The number of participants in the high category remained stable, indicating that the intervention provided did not greatly affect individuals with high self-esteem. Meanwhile, in the career maturity variable, it can be seen that there was a significant decrease in the medium category after the posttest. The low and high categories increased. This indicates polarization, where some participants experienced a significant increase in career maturity, while others experienced a decrease.

Based on table 3, it can be concluded that the intervention in the form of *photovoice* given has a complex influence on the self-esteem and career maturity of the participants. Although there were some significant changes, a definitive interpretation requires further analysis and consideration of the broader research context.

The Mann-Whitney U test was conducted to compare the post-test results of the self-esteem variable after the intervention with the *photovoice* 



method in the control group and the experimental group. The following are the results of the Mann-Whitney U test in this study.

**Table 5.** Results of the Mann-Whitney U Test on the Post-test of Self-Esteem of the Control Group and the Experimental Group

		Statistic	p
Score	Mann-Whitney U	243	<.001

Based on table 5, the U value obtained is 243. This value is a test statistic that will be compared with the critical value or p value to determine the significance of the difference. The p value obtained is <0.001. This value is much smaller than the general significance level ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). Because the p value is very small (<0.001), it can be concluded that there is a statistically significant difference between the median self-esteem of the experimental group and the control group.

These results indicate that the *photovoice* intervention given to the experimental group had a significant effect on increasing self-esteem compared to the control group that was not given the intervention. In other words, the *photovoice* intervention was proven to be effective in increasing the self-esteem of vocational high school students.

The Mann-Whitney U test was also conducted to compare the post-test results of the career maturity variable after providing intervention with the *photovoice* method in the control group and the experimental group. The results of the Mann-Whitney U test on the career maturity variable are as follows.

**Table 6.** Results of the Mann-Whitney U Test on the Career Maturity Post-test of the Control Group and Experimental Group

		Statistic	p
Score	Mann-Whitney U	16.0	<.001

Based on table 6, the U value obtained is 16.0. This value is a test statistic used to determine whether there is a significant difference between the two groups, while the p value obtained is less than 0.001 (p <0.001). This p value is very small, far below the general significance level ( $\alpha = 0.05$ ). The p value is very small (p <0.001), meaning that there is a statistically significant difference between the median career maturity in the experimental group and the control group. These results indicate that the *photovoice* intervention has a significant effect on increasing career maturity in the experimental group compared to the control group.

Based on the results of the Mann-Whitney U test on the variables of self-esteem and career maturity, it can be concluded that the *photovoice* intervention has a significant positive impact on increasing self-esteem and career maturity.

# Discussion

Overall, the results of the study indicate that photovoice is effective in increasing self-esteem and career maturity in students. This study began by conducting a pre-test first to determine the level of self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students in each group, both the control group and the experimental group. Furthermore, the experimental group was given an intervention in the form of photovoice by the researcher according to the five stages carried out in photovoice, namely (1) determining the problem and the parties who are the targets; (2) dulling the participants; (3) introducing the photovoice method and facilitating discussion in groups; (4) taking pictures by participants; and (5) discussing the results of the photos. After being given the intervention, the researcher gave a post-test to determine the differences in the levels of self-esteem and career maturity in students in the experimental group and the control group.

Based on the post-test results, there was an increase after being given an intervention in the form of *photovoice*. The results of the study showed that *photovoice* was effective in increasing self-esteem and career maturity in students. *Photovoice* is

an alternative intervention that individuals need to change their perceptions of themselves and their circumstances. *Photovoice* provides an innovative way to create situations by empowering others by providing critical awareness and stimulating action to make changes in themselves<sup>17,18</sup>.

In addition, photovoice also creates a dialogue from images that can help learners value their own opinions and empower their abilities. Through photovoice, learners take and share photos that depict their experiences and perspectives that tend to foster self-reflection, critical thinking, communication skills. This can contribute to the positive outcomes observed. Learners encouraged to express themselves creatively through photography that has the potential to empower them to recognize their strengths, challenges, and aspirations. Self-expression can lead to increased self-esteem and clearer career goals<sup>19</sup>.

Photovoice helps to reflect on experiences and learning, document obstacles faced, articulate perspectives, and generate new insights about experiences. The results of this study are also supported by Boamah's research which shows that photovoice improves critical reflection, critical thinking, social communication, and independent learning skills and increases student engagement.<sup>20</sup>.

The *photovoice* method functions as an effective teaching method <sup>2122</sup>

Students have difficulties in recognizing their strengths, such as lack of self-esteem, where students tend to have negative views about their abilities and self-esteem, such as lack of motivation, fear of failure, difficulty concentrating, difficulty establishing social relationships with others, and tend to blame themselves. Previous research shows that there is a significant relationship between self-esteem and student learning achievement. The higher the self-esteem, the better the learning achievement achieved. Self-esteem can help students in helping to achieve academic achievement<sup>23</sup>. In addition, with high self-esteem, students can overcome obstacles they may face<sup>24</sup>.

Through *photovoice*, students are helped to have high self-esteem by collaborating and finding life goals. Students with high self-esteem tend to be more confident, motivated, and persistent in facing challenges. They are also better able to build positive social relationships and have good adaptability. The effectiveness of *Photovoice* in increasing self-esteem by providing a picture of one's abilities and how to control those abilities. Research conducted by how to intervene *photovoice* by taking pictures of individual life experiences from the individual's perspective. One's own

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Amy Werremeyer et al., "Photovoice as an Intervention for College Students Living with Mental Illness: A Pilot Study," *Mental Health Clinician* 10, no. 4 (July 1, 2020): 237–43, https://doi.org/10.9740/mhc.2020.07.237.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Husnul Hidayah, Sarwititi Sarwoprasodjo, and Krishnarini Matindas, "Photovoice as a Participatory Extension Approaches Method in Expressing Youth Views of Agricultural Work," *Jurnal Penyuluhan* 16, no. 2 (2020): 303–22, https://doi.org/10.25015/16202031773.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Patricia A. Shaw, "Photo-Elicitation and Photo-Voice: Using Visual Methodological Tools to Engage with Younger Children's Voices about Inclusion in Education," *International Journal of Research and Method in Education* 44, no. 4 (2021): 337–51, https://doi.org/10.1080/1743727X.2020.1755248.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Sheila A. Boamah et al., "Using Photovoice as a Method for Capturing the Lived Experiences of Caregivers During COVID-19: A Methodological Insight," *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 21 (2022): 1–11, https://doi.org/10.1177/16094069221137494.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Nurfadilah Nadjib and Anita Triastuti, "Indonesian EFL Teachers' Portrayal of Genre-Based Teaching Practices: Perceptions, Implementation, and Challenges," *Journal on English as a Foreign Language* 13, no. 2 (2023): 475–98, https://doi.org/10.23971/jefl.v13i2.6501.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Gyuil Lee, "Exploring Environmental Constraints That Hinder the Physical Activity of Middle School Girls in Daily Life: Photo-Voice," *Korean Journal of Sport Science* 31, no. 2 (2020): 275–92, https://doi.org/10.24985/kjss.2020.31.2.275.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Elsye Mutji and Merna Mangero, "Hubungan Harga Diri Dengan Prestasi Belajar Bahasa Indonesia Siswa Sekolah Dasar," *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Citra Bakti* 7, no. 1 (2020): 92–99, https://doi.org/10.38048/jipcb.v7i1.72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Yu Cheng Lin and Huei Tse Hou, "The Evaluation of a Scaffolding-Based Augmented Reality Educational Board Game with Competition-Oriented and Collaboration-Oriented Mechanisms: Differences Analysis of Learning Effectiveness, Motivation, Flow, and Anxiety," *Interactive Learning Environments* 32, no. 2 (2024): 502–21, https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2022.2091606.



perspective is important in determining the student's experience to show their abilities to others because individuals feel they do not have the power to influence others. Students can demonstrate their ability to master and control themselves, can accept themselves well, and have the potential to achieve their desired goals.<sup>25,26</sup>

Photovoice in this study, in addition to being used to increase self-esteem, can also be used to increase career maturity. High self-esteem helps individuals improve their academic abilities to achieve mature career preparation. Crook et al., (1984) in their study, showed that self-esteem affects the level of individual career maturity by facilitating the development of mature career attitudes so that it can encourage academic and work achievement. Students with higher selfesteem are able to handle the adaptation process while building professional interests and making work-related decisions. Individuals with high selfesteem will assess themselves well and make individuals feel wanted. The results of other studies also show that there is a positive and significant relationship between self-esteem and career maturity. Krauss & Orth's research also shows that there is a prospective effect between work experience and self-esteem<sup>27, 28</sup>.

Career maturity is important for students, especially vocational high school students, so that individuals are able to choose and prepare themselves to enter the world of careers well. Career maturity needs to be possessed by students to determine the right career choices. *Photovoice* functions in collecting data and individual perspectives. According to Jehangir, *photovoice* is used to collect visual data and narrative text that

can accompany in providing a collection of data created by individuals while exploring careers that can describe intrinsic and extrinsic motivations, struggles, changes, and as a vision of the future<sup>29</sup>.

The results of the study also prove that photovoice activities by prioritizing the display of photos or images provide interest for individuals to understand themselves. This self-understanding provides strong self-confidence in the individual's self-esteem to be able to live without burden and pressure. It can be concluded that photovoice is able to provide a positive impact on the understanding and self-esteem of students or learners. In addition, through photovoice media, individuals can see the risks and impacts of work that have been displayed by the media, so that students can understand the picture of work or careers in the future. It can be concluded that the photovoice method is able to provide special experiences for students to map out a better career and future.

This research provides benefits for the field of guidance and counselling, especially in the personal and career fields. The importance of having high self-esteem and career maturity will help individuals prepare themselves and their future careers. *Photovoice* helps individuals in creating opportunities for learners to develop life skills by using images as dialogue so that they can stimulate the creation of meaning, interpretation, and shared imagination. Learners can be helped to find, share, and appreciate their individual voices by empowering individual abilities.

## Conclusion

Based on the research results, *photovoice* has proven to be effective in increasing self-esteem and career maturity in vocational high school students.

Abdul Hadi, et.al 73 Efektivitas Photovoice...

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Jurgita Tuitaitė and Polina Šedienė, "Discourse through Photovoice: 'Lived Experience' of Epilepsy," *SHS Web of Conferences* 68 (2019): 02014, https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/20196802014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Robin Lennon-Dearing and Melissa Hirschi, "A Photovoice Empowerment Intervention for Women Living with HIV," *Journal of HIV/AIDS and Social Services* 18, no. 4 (October 2, 2019): 347–66, https://doi.org/10.1080/15381501.2019.1658683.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Shafa Geulistia NuraniI et al., "Effectiveness of Gel Formulation of Mahogany (Swietenia Macrophylla) Bark

Extract and Its Potential as an Anti-Inflammatory in White Male Rats (Rattus Norvegicus)," *Nusantara Bioscience* 14, no. 1 (2022): 117–21, https://doi.org/10.13057/nusbiosci/n140114.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Katon Agung Ramadhan et al., "The Development of Hots-Based Student Worksheets with Discovery Learning Model," *Universal Journal of Educational Research* 8, no. 3 (2020): 888–94, https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.080320.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Yanuari Srianturi and Mamat Supriatna, "Analysis of Career Maturity on High School Students," 2020.



The results of providing *photovoice* intervention to increase students' self-esteem are proven by the statistically significant difference between the median self-esteem of the experimental group and the control group. Students can change their perceptions of themselves and their circumstances by utilizing their abilities. The results of providing *photovoice* intervention can also increase students' career maturity as evidenced by the statistically significant difference between the median career maturity in the experimental group and the control group. Students are able to choose, determine, and prepare themselves to enter the world of career well.

*Photovoice* is one of the alternative interventions that can be used to overcome self-esteem and career maturity issues in vocational high school students. The results of the study can be used as considerations for counsellors and counselling teachers when facing similar problems. This study was only conducted in vocational high schools in Bantul. The results may not be generalizable to all vocational schools with high different characteristics. In addition, it is important to combine *photovoice* with other relevant interventions to achieve optimal results. In addition to photovoice, there may be other factors that influence the increase in self-esteem and career maturity of students, such as family support, interaction with peers, or other intervention programs that are running in schools.

This study makes a significant contribution to the field of education and counselling. The results show the great potential of *photovoice* as a tool to improve self-esteem and career maturity of vocational high school students. However, there is still much room for further research to enrich our understanding of the effectiveness and working mechanisms of this intervention.

This research has limitations, including: the number of samples is still less than expected in the field, the psychological condition of the subjects in the study needs to be explored further and there are several other aspects that affect the variables of career maturity and student self-esteem. Furthermore, subsequent research is expected to be able to analyze more deeply the factors that affect the level of career maturity and student self-

esteem and be able to analyze the weaknesses of photovoice in improving career maturity and selfesteem of vocational high schools.

# Acknowledgements

The researcher would like to thank Mercu Buana University Yogyakarta for their assistance in conducting the research. In addition, the researcher also gives appreciation to the schools that have participated in this research. Hopefully this research will be useful in improving educational services, especially guidance and counseling services in schools in the personal and career fields.

## References

# **Books**

Srianturi, Yanuari, and Mamat Supriatna. "Analysis of Career Maturity on High School Students," 2020.

Sutarna, Agus, Hadion Wijoyo, Irjus Indrawan, and Bero Usada. *Manajemen Pendidikan Vokasi*, 2020.

# Journal

Atli, Abdullah. "The Effects of Trait-Factor Theory Bassed Career Counseling Sessions on the Levels of Career Maturity and Indecision of High School Students." Universal Journal of Educational Research 4, no. 8 (2016): 1837–47. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2016.040813

Boamah, Sheila A., Marie Lee Yous, Rachel Weldrick, Farinaz Havaei, and Rebecca Ganann. "Using *Photovoice* as a Method for Capturing the Lived Experiences of Caregivers During COVID-19: A Methodological Insight." *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 21 (2022): 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1177/160940692211374 94.

Doroud, Nastaran, Ellie Fossey, Tracy Fortune, Lisa Brophy, and Louise Mountford. "A Journey of Living Well: A Participatory *Photovoice* Study Exploring Recovery and Everyday Activities with People Experiencing Mental Illness." *Journal of Mental Health* 31, no. 2 (2022): 246–54. https://doi.org/10.1080/09638237.2021.19 52950.

Faradilla, Sandita Sanis, Teza Yudha, and Moch. Faizal Rizki. "Penanganan Gelandangan

- Dan Pengemis: Studi Naratif Dengan *Photovoice.*" *Journal Of Social Science Research* 3, no. 5 (2023): 7824–40.
- Fatmawati, Erni, Dini Oktarika, Danar Santoso, Heni Puspitasari, Ratih Widya Nurcahyo, and Maesyta Indah Sari. "Kesiapan Kerja Siswa Ditinjau Dari Harga Diri (Self-Esteem) Dan Efikasi Diri (Self-Efficacy)." Edukasi: Jurnal Pendidikan 21, no. 1 (June 10, 2023): 1–14. https://doi.org/10.31571/edukasi.v21i1.54 62.
- Harian Jogja. "Siap Terjun Ke Dunia Industri, Lulusan SMK Harus Tetap Tingkatkan Ketrampilan," 2024. https://jogjapolitan.harianjogja.com/read/ 2024/05/16/510/1174763/siap-terjun-kedunia-industri-lulusan-smk-harus-tetaptingkatkan-ketrampilan.
- Harley, Dana, Sakina Grome, Suk Hee Kim, Tara McLendon, Vanessa Hunn, James Canfield, Rose, and Anjanette Wells. "Perceptions of Success Selfand Sustainability Among Women Participating in an Entrepreneurial Skills Development and Empowerment Program Through Photovoice." Journal of Ethnic and Cultural Diversity in Social Work 29, no. 5 (September 2020): 377-95. https://doi.org/10.1080/15313204.2017.13 44900.
- Hidayah, Husnul, Sarwititi Sarwoprasodjo, and Krishnarini Matindas. "Photovoice as a Participatory Extension Approaches Method in Expressing Youth Views of Agricultural Work." Jurnal Penyuluhan 16, no. 2 (2020): 303–22. https://doi.org/10.25015/16202031773.
- Hieu, Cao Xuan. "Employing *Photovoice* in Improving Students' Speaking Skill at a Primary School." *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research* 6, no. 11 (2023): 6752–58.
- https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v6-i11-23. Holas, Pawel, Melanie Kowalczyk, Izabela Krejtz, Katarzyna Wisiecka, and Tomasz Jankowski. "The Relationship between Self-Esteem and Self-Compassion in Socially Anxious." *Current Psychology* 42, no. 12 (2023): 10271–76. https://doi.org/10.1007/s12144-021-02305-2.

- Karmann, Julie, Ingrid Handlovsky, Sonia Lu, Gregory Moullec, Katherine L. Frohlich, and Olivier Ferlatte. "Resilience among Older Adults during the COVID-19 Pandemic: A *Photovoice* Study." *SSM Qualitative* Research in Health 3, no. November 2022 (2023). https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmqr.2023.1002 56.
- Lee, Gyuil. "Exploring Environmental Constraints
  That Hinder the Physical Activity of Middle
  School Girls in Daily Life: Photo-Voice."

  Korean Journal of Sport Science 31, no. 2 (2020):
  275–92.
  https://doi.org/10.24985/kjss.2020.31.2.27
- Lennon-Dearing, Robin, and Melissa Hirschi. "A *Photovoice* Empowerment Intervention for Women Living with HIV." *Journal of HIV/AIDS and Social Services* 18, no. 4 (October 2, 2019): 347–66. https://doi.org/10.1080/15381501.2019.16 58683.
- Yu Cheng, and Huei Tse Hou. "The Lin, Evaluation of a Scaffolding-Based Augmented Reality Educational Board Game with Competition-Oriented and Collaboration-Oriented Mechanisms: Differences Analysis of Learning Effectiveness, Motivation, Flow, and Anxiety." Interactive Learning Environments 32, (2024): 502-21. https://doi.org/10.1080/10494820.2022.20 91606.
- Mutji, Elsye, and Merna Mangero. "Hubungan Harga Diri Dengan Prestasi Belajar Bahasa Indonesia Siswa Sekolah Dasar." *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Citra Bakti* 7, no. 1 (2020): 92–99.
  - https://doi.org/10.38048/jipcb.v7i1.72.
- Nadjib, Nurfadilah, and Anita Triastuti. "Indonesian EFL Teachers' Portrayal of Genre-Based Teaching Practices: Perceptions, Implementation, and Challenges." *Journal on English as a Foreign Language* 13, no. 2 (2023): 475–98. https://doi.org/10.23971/jefl.v13i2.6501.
- NuraniI, Shafa Geulistia, Nafasya Negiy Deluna, Putri Nabila, and Syamsul Falah. "Effectiveness of Gel Formulation of Mahogany (Swietenia Macrophylla) Bark Extract and Its Potential as an Anti-Inflammatory in White Male Rats (Rattus

- Norvegicus)." Nusantara Bioscience 14, no. 1 (2022): 117–21. https://doi.org/10.13057/nusbiosci/n1401 14.
- Ramadhan, Katon Agung, Suparman, Yahva Hairun, and Asmar Bani. "The Development Hots-Based Student of Worksheets with Discovery Learning Model." Universal Journal of Educational (2020): 3 Research 8, no. 888-94. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.080320
- Samaiya, Anupi. "Jean Piaget's Cognitive Development," 2022. https://doi.org/10.25215/1001.155.
- Shaw, Patricia A. "Photo-Elicitation and Photo-Voice: Using Visual Methodological Tools to Engage with Younger Children's Voices about Inclusion in Education." *International Journal of Research and Method in Education* 44, no. 4 (2021): 337–51. https://doi.org/10.1080/1743727X.2020.1 755248.

- Tuitaitė, Jurgita, and Polina Šedienė. "Discourse through *Photovoice*: 'Lived Experience' of Epilepsy." *SHS Web of Conferences* 68 (2019): 02014.
  - https://doi.org/10.1051/shsconf/2019680 2014.
- Wang, Caroline, and Mary Ann Burris. "Photovoice: Concept, Methodology, and Use for Participatory Needs Assessment." Health Education and Behavior 24, no. 3 (1997): 369–87.
  - https://doi.org/10.1177/109019819702400 309.
- Werremeyer, Amy, Elizabeth Skoy, William Burns, and Amber Bach-Gorman. "*Photovoice* as an Intervention for College Students Living with Mental Illness: A Pilot Study." *Mental Health Clinician* 10, no. 4 (July 1, 2020): 237–43.
  - https://doi.org/10.9740/mhc.2020.07.237.
- Zyberaj, Jetmir, Sebastian Seibel, Annika F. Schowalter, Lennart Pötz, Stefanie Richter-Killenberg, and Judith Volmer. "Developing Sustainable Careers during a Pandemic: The Role of Psychological Capital and Career Adaptability." *Sustainability (Switzerland)* 14, no. 5 (2022). https://doi.org/10.3390/su14053105.